

CITY NORTH HERITAGE REVIEW

Overview and Recommendations (volume 1)



Royal Artillery Hotel, 614 Elizabeth Street, Melbourne



Villa, 95 Flemington Road, North Melbourne



Former Repco Building, 90 Berkeley Street, Carlton



Melbourne Terrace Apartments, 416 Queen Street

2 METHODOLOGY

2.1 General

The methodology adopted in undertaking this review is in accordance with the processes and criteria outlined in the Australia ICOMOS Charter for the Conservation of Places of Cultural Significance, known as the *Burra Charter*.

- Undertake a site inspection.
- Undertake historical research.
- Prepare a physical description.
- Analyse the significance of the site based on the research and the extant fabric.
- Prepare a citation (statement of significance, history and description) for those sites warranting heritage protection. This would include a grading and relating the aspects of significance to the AHC criteria.

2.2 Site Inspections

Over 400 sites within the study area were assessed, of which some 370 sites were provided in the project list. Many of these sites were within an existing heritage overlay (individual or precinct) however about 50 had no heritage protection. Many of the latter group had been graded in a previous heritage study whilst for others there was no grading. These ungraded sites came to be on the list as part of a general heritage assessment of the area undertaken by Meredith Gould in *Heritage Assessment – City North Structure Plan Area*, April 2011.

Initially during late April and early May, a survey was undertaken on foot by two consultants over the course of several days in which every building in the study area was considered for potential heritage significance in order to gain a broad overview of the range of the extant building fabric. Any existing heritage site, or site of heritage interest, was recorded (photographed, given a preliminary grading, and noting distinguishing features). Sites were inspected from the perimeter, including lane way if possible.

Subsequently, it was necessary to return to sites, for which a citation was to be prepared, in order to take more detailed photographs and notes.

2.3 Research

In regards to the potential heritage overlays, the sources consulted have been a combination of primary and secondary sources. The primary sources have included files at the Public Records Office of Victoria (PROV) especially the building application index (VPRS 11,202), as well as the related plans (VPRS 11,200) and files (VPRS 11,201).

Historic plans provide useful information. Those typically consulted include:

- Township Plans
- MMBW (Melbourne Metropolitan Board of Works)
- Mahlstedt Fire Insurance Plans (these did not cover parts of Carlton and North Melbourne)
- Other historical plans: Kearney, Cox, etc.

Where necessary, other sources consulted to understand the key developmental phase at a site varied but may have involved referring to any of the following:

- Rates Books for both the City of Melbourne (VPRS 5708) and City of Hotham, now North Melbourne, (initially a borough, later a town).
- Directories: Sands & Kenny and Sands & McDougall's
- Certificates of Title
- Application files
- Historic photographs (e.g. State Library of Victoria, Picture Victoria)
- Burchett Index (building notices prior to 1916).

2.4 Physical Description

A physical description has been provided based on the site inspections. The description usually includes a determination of the architectural style of the building, details of what elements are original, or not, and any distinguishing features.

2.5 Assessment of Significance

As for heritage professionals generally in Australia, the process outlined in the *Burra Charter* underpins the approach to heritage assessment and conservation adopted by the authors of this report.

2.5.1 Burra Charter

The methodology adopted in the assessment of the significance (or Heritage values) of the place is in accordance with the process outlined in the *Burra Charter* (or *The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance*). As outlined in the *Burra Charter*, the criteria considered include aesthetic (including architectural), historical, scientific (or technical), social and spiritual values.

2.5.2 Gradings

The following tables outline the current definitions in Clause 22.05 (Heritage Places outside the Capital City Zone) of the Melbourne Planning Scheme. Buildings are graded 'A' to 'D' and their streetscape value is assigned a level, 1 to 3, both in descending order of significance.

Buildings

Grading	Definition
A	'A' buildings are of national or state importance, and are irreplaceable parts of Australia's built form heritage. Many will be either already included on, or recommended for inclusion on the Victorian Heritage Register or the Register of the National Estate.
B	'B' buildings are of regional or metropolitan significance, and stand as important milestones in the architectural development of the metropolis. Many will be either already included on, or recommended for inclusion on the Register of the National Estate.
C	'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.
D	'D' buildings are representative of the historical, scientific, architectural or social development of the local area. They are often reasonably intact representatives of particular periods, styles or building types. In many instances alterations will be reversible. They may also be altered examples which stand within a group of similar period, style or type or a street which retains

Grading	Definition
	much of its original character. Where they stand in a row or street, the collective group will provide a setting which reinforces the value of the individual buildings.

Streetscapes

Streetscape	Definition
Level 1	Level 1 streetscapes are collections of buildings outstanding either because they are a particularly well preserved group from a similar period or style, or because they are highly significant buildings in their own right.
Level 2	Level 2 streetscapes are of significance either because they still retain the predominant character and scale of a similar period or style, or because they contain individually significant buildings.
Level 3	Level 3 streetscapes may contain significant buildings, but they will be from diverse periods or styles, and of low individual significance or integrity.

2.5.3 AHC Criteria

The AHC criteria developed by the Australian Heritage Commission (now Australian Heritage Council) have been employed where appropriate in the citations (volumes 2 to 4). Reference to the relevant AHC criteria is defined in brackets within the statements of significance (for example A4 or B2).

The thresholds for local significance have been determined according to the guidelines and examples outlined in the 'Criteria for the Register of the National Estate - Application Guidelines', which was prepared by the Australia Heritage Commission in April 1990.

The AHC criteria are listed below. Some of the criteria relate specifically to natural history and were not applicable to this study (and are noted as such in brackets):

Criterion	Definition
A: Its Importance in the course, or pattern, of Australia's natural or cultural history	<p>A.1 Importance in the evolution of Australian flora, fauna, landscapes or climate. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>A.2 Importance in maintaining existing processes or natural systems at the regional or national scale. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>A.3 Importance in exhibiting unusual richness or diversity of flora, fauna, landscapes or cultural features. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>A.4 Importance for association with events, developments or cultural phases which have had a significant role in the human occupation and evolution of the nation, State, region or community.</p>
B: Its possession of uncommon, rare or	B.1 Importance for rare, endangered or uncommon flora, fauna,

Criterion	Definition
endangered aspects of Australia's natural or cultural history	<p>communities, ecosystems, natural landscapes or phenomena, or as a wilderness. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>B.2 Importance in demonstrating a distinctive way of life, custom, process, land-use, function or design no longer practised, in danger of being lost, or of exceptional interest</p>
C: its potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of Australia's natural or cultural history	<p>C.1 Importance for information contributing to a wider understanding of Australian natural history, by virtue of its use as a research site, teaching site, type locality, reference or benchmark site. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>C.2 Importance for information contributing to a wider understanding of the history of human occupation of Australia.</p>
D: its importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of: (i) a class of Australia's natural or cultural places; or (ii) a class of Australia's natural or cultural environments	<p>D.1 Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of the range of landscapes, environments or ecosystems, the attributes of which identify them as being characteristic of their class. [Not applicable to this study]</p> <p>D.2 Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of the range of human activities in the Australian environment (including way of life, philosophy, custom, process, land use, function, design or technique).</p>
E: its importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics valued by a community or cultural group	E.1 Importance for a community for aesthetic characteristics held in high esteem or otherwise valued by the community.
F: its importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period	F.1 Importance for its technical, creative, design or artistic excellence, innovation or achievement.
G: its strong or special associations with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	G.1 Importance as a place highly valued by a community for reasons of religious, spiritual, symbolic, cultural, educational, or social associations.
H: its special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Australia's natural or cultural history	H.1 Importance for close associations with individuals whose activities have been significant within the history of the nation, State or region