PART 2: WHAT HAVE WE LEARNT SO FAR?
3. AN UNDESIRABLE PLACE TO BE

Community Experience

During the community engagement activity in February - March this year, we asked participants what the reason was for their visit to City Road. Overwhelmingly, the community members who chose to comment the most were local residents - 120 of a total of 182 comments were made by residents. Of these comments, 90 per cent expressed a negative experience of City Road. Predominantly, these residents were commenting on their experience as pedestrians in the street. In their comments, they emphasised that City Road is not a desirable place to be in. The predominant emotions expressed by this group were, unsafe (32 per cent), frustrated (22 per cent), angry (16 per cent) and sad (10 per cent).

Figure 3.1: Emotions expressed by residents on City Road (120 comments).
Walking from Whiteman Street (home) to the Boyd Centre - the “journey” is not a relaxing and pleasant experience as a local resident. There is no feeling of a planned clustering of retail versus food versus office mix. It is a very mixed bag of businesses that do not relate. Importantly, there is no green space or pedestrian friendly pathway to make the “journey” to the Boyd Centre a pleasant one for local residents.

*Local Journeyman, resident*
Street Character and Identity

The public realm is not designed for the comfort, safety or enjoyment of pedestrians. It therefore does not support street activity. The quality of City Road is determined both by the way buildings interface the street and the design and layout, use and materiality of the street itself.

Public / Private Interface

Recent work by the City of Melbourne has established new requirements for private development to improve the way buildings interface with the street. This includes requirements to actively front City Road with business or retail that provide direct interaction at street level and at upper levels that screen blank, generally unoccupied uses such as car parking or services. New requirements to mitigate negative wind impacts have also been prescribed and measures to reduce conflict between pedestrian areas and access to off-street car parking have been introduced. These requirements are all focused on improving the pedestrian experience of City Road.

Existing design and layout

City Road varies in width and design along its length. At its widest point the street measures 40 m with 30 m being taken up by roadway. At its narrowest it measures 30 m with 20 m...
being taken up by roadway. The roadway and its supporting infrastructure dominates the street and limits the potential for a diverse range of uses and activities. Signage, traffic lights, road line markings and driveways are a dominant feature along the full length of City Road and reflect the dominance of traffic in the area.

City Road also has three major road overpasses – the West Gate Freeway, Kings Way and St. Kilda Road. These overpasses create leftover and poorly defined spaces at the City Road level which create unpleasant and uninviting environments. Adjacent sites on City Road accommodate large billboards and signage at the detriment of the public realm.

Poor quality materials, old street furniture, overhead power lines and compromised street trees reflect the lack of attention City Road has received over many years.

Trucks and building construction contribute to City Road being a noisy, dusty and often smelly environment – with few places of relief for pedestrians.

Contrary to most of City Road the Boyd Community Hub and Testing Grounds have managed to provide areas of relief where people can stop, relax, socialise and engage with the local community.

**Lack of street activity**

Most pedestrian traffic on City Road is there from necessity, not choice. That is, local residents, workers and visitors need to use City Road to get to where they are going – to Boyd, to the Hoddle grid, to South Melbourne (particularly the market and Clarendon Street) or to a public transport stop. These pedestrian trips are necessary and take place under all conditions.

Jan Gehl (City for People, 2010) articulates the difference between these necessary trips and the optional and social activities that emerge when better public realm conditions are in place (see figure 3.3).
Optional activities are those that people choose to undertake. Often recreational, they include choosing to stop, sit, converse and generally stay in a place to enjoy the weather, places and life of a city. The quality of public spaces therefore directly affect the extent of city life, and subsequently, the degree of social exchanges and activities that will occur. These are frequently unpredictable and spontaneous.

The City Road Master Plan therefore focuses on improvements to the street design and layout, use and materiality. Key criteria to achieve high quality, pedestrian friendly places where people choose to be, are illustrated in figure 3.4. These are focused on attracting people to a place through careful design that prioritises protection (including safety), comfort and delight.

City Road, by contrast is not perceived as a safe, comfortable or delightful place.
Figure 3.4: Jan Gehl’s 12 quality criteria for the pedestrian landscape.
Image Source: Gehl, City for People, 2010
4. A DIFFICULT PLACE TO GET AROUND

The Community Experience

During the community engagement activity in February - March this year, we asked participants what their mode of transport was when experiencing City Road. In order, the community members who chose to comment were pedestrians (50 per cent of comments), cyclists (19 per cent) then drivers (19 per cent) – see figure 4.2. A smaller number of comments were also received from motorcyclists, public transports users plus others (transport mode not specified).

As ninety per cent of all comments were negative, it is fair to conclude that across all transport modes, there is discontent with the experience of people getting around and through City Road.
If cycling north, turning right onto Balston St is hectic on a bike - hard to get across to the right hand lane, and then stuck in the middle of the road between two busy lanes of traffic.

_HJ, commuter_

The area around the tram stop under Kings Way is extremely neglected, but highly utilised. With no convenient crossing, pedestrians and public transport users have to dash across the road without a clear line of sight where traffic is coming from.

_Leonora, resident_

I’m a very experienced cyclist, but this intersection (City Road/Queens Bridge Street) is one of the scariest in Melbourne.

_Steve, passing through_

Nobody knows which lane to be in at these junctions (Power Street) - the people who want to go straight ahead either get caught in the left turning traffic or sent off to the right as we wanted to avoid the left turners. Very confusing!

_Lisa, resident_

---

Figure 4.2: The number of experiences shared online by mode of transport
The Pedestrian Experience

Key Findings

• City Road is perceived as a significant pedestrian barrier, separating Southbank into two halves, in particular, disconnecting the Arts Precinct from the Yarra River Precinct.

• Most pedestrian trips along City Road are of necessity, not a route of choice.

• The predominance of traffic (noise, physical proximity) dramatically influences the pedestrian experience of City Road.

• Generally perceived as an unsafe and frustrating place to walk along.

Figure 4.3: Emotions expressed by pedestrians on City Road (91 comments).

Figure 4.4: Location of experiences shared by pedestrians
A summary of the issues affecting the pedestrian experience are outlined below. These have been prepared from site visits, community responses, the recent traffic study (see Appendix A) and previous investigations into the road. Opportunities to address these considerations are outlined in Part Three of this report.

• Intersections are particularly challenging for pedestrians - slip lanes increase crossing distances and reduce safety.

• Crashes involving pedestrians make up a significant proportion of crashes in the study area, above Metropolitan and Victorian averages. This is significant considering there are fewer pedestrians than in the CBD and pedestrian volumes will increase into the future. These crashes occurred both at intersections and mid-block.

• The walking environment is generally unpleasant and unwelcoming (see Chapter 3 for further explanation). Key features that contribute to this experience are:
  - Few benches, bins, water fountains, public toilets, open space.
  - Poor quality materials and finishes.
  - Inconsistent width of footpaths – narrow in some sections, wide in others (3.3 m - 6 m).
  - Poor amenity of undercroft spaces and lack of lighting (West Gate Freeway, Kings Way, St. Kilda Road)
  - Width of side road crossings and lack of pedestrian protection (no pedestrian islands which can reduce crossing distance and provide refuge from traffic).

“Walking along City Road to Boyd is unpleasant. It doesn’t feel like a pedestrian access area. The traffic is high, noise is high, the pollution is evident - therefore it is not a pleasant experience to walk down with children.”

Marielle, resident
• Lack of way-finding signage - this is exacerbated by the irregular street pattern in Southbank that makes it difficult to navigate through the suburb.

• Many pedestrian desire lines are not facilitated and there are few crossing opportunities in comparison to the Hoddle Grid resulting in people crossing at unsignalised points (see figure 4.5/4.6).

• Frequency of driveway crossovers - this includes access to off-street car parking which creates potential conflicts between vehicular and pedestrian movements, and redundant crossovers which create unnecessary level changes in the footpath and reduce the visual quality of the streetscape.

• Difficult access to St. Kilda Road - not Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) compliant as the primary connection is a staircase. DDA access involves a significant detour via Sturt Street/Southbank Boulevard or via Alexandra Avenue and the parkland.

• High level of noise from freight and other vehicle traffic.

• Flooding of public realm, particularly City Road West.

• Footpaths blocked off ‘temporarily’ by construction of new developments.

• Pedestrian crossing delays at intersections due to long traffic light cycles which prioritise traffic flow.

• No automatic pedestrian crossing activation.

Figure 4.5: Along the length of the City Road Study Area there are 10 pedestrian crossings and 10 public benches.
Figure 4.6: Along the same length of Swanston Street there are 27 pedestrian crossings and over 150 public benches.
The Cycling Experience

Key Findings

• No dedicated cycle infrastructure on City Road or Alexandra Avenue despite being designated cycling routes on the Principal Bicycle Network and (west of Power Street) on the Network Operating Plan.

• Generally perceived as unsafe for cyclists.

• Identified as an alternate east-west route to the congested Southbank Promenade but currently not designed for this role.

Figure 4.7: Emotions expressed by cyclists on City Road (35 comments).

Figure 4.8: Location of experiences shared by cyclists
A summary of the issues affecting the cycling experience are outlined below. These have been prepared from site visits, community responses, the recent traffic study (see Appendix A) and previous investigations into the road. Opportunities to address these considerations are outlined in Part Three of this report.

- There is currently no dedicated cycle infrastructure/lanes on City Road or Alexandra Avenue, despite their designation as cycling routes on the VicRoads Principal Bicycle Network.
- The SmartRoads Network Operating Plan identifies a preferred cycle route from Bay Street, Port Melbourne, east along City Road, right at Southbank Boulevard and Linlithgow Avenue to reconnect with the Yarra River Trail.
- Southbank Promenade is over crowded with pedestrians and cyclists. An alternative east-west route is required for commuter cyclists. (Yarra River Corridor Pedestrian & Cycling Safety Plan, 2013)
- Crashes involving cyclists make up a significant proportion of crashes in City Road East and West. This is significant considering there are fewer cyclists than in the CBD and cyclist volumes will increase into the future.
- Poor cyclist safety from lack of dedicated cycle infrastructure and fast speed of vehicles.
- Some cyclists use the footpaths as the road is seen to be unsafe.
- Bus lane shared with bikes in City Road West (east bound).
- Limited bike parking along the street. New apartments are required to have bike storage.
- No intersection priority.
- Poor signage.
- Existing bike lane on Queens Bridge Street ends before City Road intersection.

“I don’t use City Rd on my bike, as I feel unsafe, but I would love to be able to.”

Jane, resident
The Public Transport Passenger Experience

Key Findings

- Limited public transport provision on City Road with no connections to South Melbourne (key destination for locals’ everyday shopping needs).
- Interchanges and public transport stops generally perceived as of poor quality, unsafe and lacking visibility.
- Public transport stops not DDA compliant.

Figure 4.9: Emotions expressed by public transport passengers (8 comments)

Figure 4.10: Location of experiences shared by public transport passengers
A summary of the issues affecting the public transport passenger experience are outlined below. These have been prepared from site visits, community responses, the recent traffic study (see Appendix A) and previous investigations into the road. Opportunities to address these considerations are outlined in Part Three of this report.

• Generally limited public transport in comparison to Hoddle grid.

• Public transport doesn’t connect people to key destinations (e.g South Melbourne Market).

• Any proposals to change the road layout will need to allow for increased frequency of and improvements to the public transport network into the future.

• This is of particular importance for future routes connecting to Fishermans Bend in the south west (with a projected population capacity of 80,000).

• Lack of way-finding at transport interchanges.

• Quality, safety and visibility of public transport interchanges is generally poor - bus stops and tram stops.

• Poor efficiency of services.

• Tram stops are not DDA compliant.

• Tram stops under Kings Way - very unpleasant and subject to flooding.

• Public transport is better in City Road West where there are two tram lines and buses, including a section of dedicated bus lane on the north side of City Road West to Queens Bridge Street only.

• Limited public transport in City Road East and Alexandra Avenue.

"No public transport that directly connects the Arts Precinct to South Melbourne Market and Port Melbourne / Bay Street.

There are a number of older residents in Southbank who depend on public transport.

Local resident"
The Driving Experience

Key Findings

• Generally perceived as a frustrating and angering experience.

• Confusion perceived at intersections around lane selection/way-finding, particularly at Southbank Boulevard and Power Street.

• Conflicts between local access to off-street car parking, traffic flow and pedestrian activity.

• Lack of short-term parking near Boyd.

• Queuing on Swan Street Bridge has significant congestion impacts for Alexandra Avenue and back to City Road.

Figure 4.11: Emotions expressed by drivers on City Road (34 comments)

Figure 4.12: Location of experiences shared by drivers
A summary of the issues affecting the driving experience are outlined below. These have been prepared from site visits, community responses, the recent traffic study (see Appendix A) and previous investigations into the road. Opportunities to address these considerations are outlined in Part Three of this report.

**General**

- Width of lanes is inconsistent and could be reduced in sections - wider lane widths encourages high speeds.
- City Road is classified as an urban arterial road under SmartRoads with a speed limit of 60 km/h. This conflicts with Capital City zoning (all roads in Hoddle Grid, including arterials are 40km/h).
- The road is characterised by 2-3 traffic lanes in each direction, very large intersections with multiple lanes, some with slip lanes.
- There is some on-street car parking and clearways operate in parts.
- City Road was designed to earlier, now outdated standards e.g. intersection radii need review. The angle of slip lanes encourages high vehicle speeds.

**City Road West**

- City Road West carries much less traffic than the rest of the road, fulfilling more of a local traffic movement function.
- There is a lack of short-term parking for Boyd users.
- Entry into apartment building car parks off City Road is challenging for drivers.

**City Road East**

- East of Power Street, City Road is used as an alternative to the CityLink Burnley Tunnel for placarded vehicles and over dimensional vehicles. It is also the alternative route in times of tunnel closure.
- City Road East and Alexandra Avenue form a major CityLink exit into the Central City. Consequently, there are far greater traffic flows on these sections of the road often resulting in congestion during peak periods.
- Drivers often experience confusion over which lane to be in at intersections.

**Alexandra Avenue**

- Perception that vehicles frequently speed on approach from Alexandra Avenue and through St Kilda Road underpass.
- Drivers emerging from St Kilda Road underpass have difficulty knowing which lane to be in to enter the Hoddle Grid.
- Alternate route to Burnley Tunnel (see above).
- Swan Street Bridge congestion causes queuing up of traffic along Alexandra Avenue with drivers trying to merge into left lane at last minute.
5. POOR ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE

Key Findings

- Significant extent of impermeable surfaces - concrete and bitumen - contribute to urban heat island effect.
- Lack of significant tree canopy and infrequent planting of varying sizes and condition.
- City Road West subject to flooding events.
- Lack of Integrated Water Management solutions.

Figure 5.1: Issues for environmental performance of City Road
Urban Forest

Existing tree canopy is poor throughout City Road due to:

- Limited planting space on narrow pedestrian footpaths.
- Obstruction from overhead power lines.
- Large vehicle access requirements.
- Overpasses.
- Underground services.

Flooding and permeable surfaces

Southbank is a flood prone area, particularly around City Road West.

There are currently few permeable surfaces along City Road, with the exception of the gardens flanking Alexandra Avenue.

Most of the permeable surfaces along City Road are in the private realm.

“"This stretch of road should be planted with the same type of plant, shrub or tree to give it a distinctive feel to tie it all in together as one street. It also needs some street furniture or lighting that has a more residential feel.

Rodney, resident"

“"When it rains in huge amounts for long periods the road floods... sometimes, up to knee high.

Ken, resident"

“"The city pavement needs permeability to absorb rain water so that we can grow healthy trees.

Angelo, resident"

“"The tramstop and crossing under Kings Way is awful. There is poor drainage which results in the tram stop and pedestrian crossing being flooded after heavy rain.

Melanie, visitor"
PART 3: WHAT ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES?
The City of Melbourne has identified a suite of opportunities for improvement across the City Road Study Area. These opportunities will be explained in greater detail throughout this chapter. They fall into three categories:

1. Four key moves that will significantly change the identity and performance of City Road. They are:
   - Enhance Boyd into a local hub
   - Re-establish a city connection
   - Enhance pedestrian comfort and access
   - Create a cycle street

2. General opportunities that can be considered along the full study area to improve the comfort, accessibility and performance of the street.

3. Specific site improvements that have been identified from a detailed site inspection and the traffic and analysis report.

### Four Key Moves

#### Enhance Boyd into a local hub

- Stitch BOYD together with its surrounds and capture the potential of lost space under Kings Way.
- Create a public transport interchange.
- Address flooding and urban heat.
- Incubate local community activities and local businesses.

#### Re-establish a city connection

- Re-establish City Road’s connection to the city.
- Connect the Arts Precinct with the Yarra Precinct.
- Resolve City Road’s connection to parkland.
Figure 6.1: Four key moves

Create a cycle street

- Improve safety with the introduction of a dedicated and separated on-road lane.
- Connect to the existing cycling network.
- Provide an East-West alternative to the Yarra Corridor.

Enhance pedestrian comfort and access

- Overcome City Road as a pedestrian barrier, in particular connecting the Arts Precinct to the Yarra River precinct and generally improving north-south connectivity.
- Improve pedestrian amenity and safety.
General Improvement Opportunities

The following general opportunities can be applied along varying sections of City Road. They address opportunities to improve movement and access, the character and experience, and the environmental performance of City Road.

Many of the opportunities intersect - for example, expanding the urban forest will also have significant benefits to the character and experience of the street.

Improving environmental performance

Expand urban forest

Expand the urban forest in order to meet the City of Melbourne’s target of 40 per cent canopy cover of the public realm by 2040.

Increase permeability

Increase permeable surfaces to 30 per cent of public realm through natural ground coverings and innovative artificial surfaces, particularly in flood prone areas of City Road West.
Improving character and experience

Underground power lines
Move overhead power lines underground to improve visual amenity of the streetscape and conform with Central City design standards.

Improve waste management
Manage domestic and construction waste removal with respect to the public realm. Where possible, waste removal to be limited to service entrances and back streets.

Improve night time safety - lighting
Enhance safety around undercroft spaces and along City Road through lighting design treatments sensitive to pedestrian use.

Introduce street furniture
Install street furniture that is in keeping with Central City design standards in appropriate locations.

Introduce central city materials
Use a consistent Central City materials palette throughout the City Road East Arts/Yarra River Precinct, (bluestone paving, etc.). Local materials palette to be developed for City Road West.

Introduce public art
Utilise proximity to Arts Precinct to explore opportunities for public art and creative uses of public space.

Improving movement and access

Improve way-finding
Assist pedestrians and cyclists in finding connections through the unconventional street network of the Yarra River, Arts and Local Precincts.

Reduce speed limit
Reduce speed limits along City Road to maximum 50km/h to improve safety for all transport modes and provide consistency across the Central City.

Reschedule signal phases
Reschedule signal phases to facilitate more efficient movement of various road users. Peak/off-peak signal phasing to be considered.

Reduce traffic lane widths (where possible)
Where possible, reduce lane widths to accommodate road use for various modes, improve north-south access and enhance pedestrian comfort.

Site specific Opportunities

The following pages illustrate specific site improvements that could be made to improve City Road West, City Road East and Alexandra Avenue. These have been identified through community engagement, site visits and the recent traffic analysis report (See appendix A).

These opportunities will be further tested and considered in the preparation of the draft Master Plan.
City Road West

Figure 6.2: Opportunities in City Road West

1. Improve pedestrian footpath and cycle links under West Gate Freeway.

2. Provide a pedestrian crossing near Clarke Street.

Improve pedestrian footpath and cycle links under West Gate Freeway.

Provide a pedestrian crossing near Clarke Street.
Provide a median between Clarendon Street and Queens Bridge Street.

Potential for a new mid block pedestrian crossing.

Seek to rationalise turns at the Queens Bridge Street - City Road - Power Street triangle.

Improve footpath conditions by removing redundant driveway crossovers.

Improve footpath conditions and reduce pedestrian crossing times. Create a more legible and attractive connection to Moray Street.

Upgrade the public space on the corner of Queens Bridge Street and City Road.

Narrow the carriageway to provide an on-road bicycle facility or a wider footpath. Parking should be permitted in the kerb side lane during off-peak periods.

Improve footpath conditions by removing redundant driveway crossovers.

Improve the pedestrian environment at the Power Street and City Road intersection.
City Road East

Figure 6.3: Opportunities in City Road East

Widen the footpath at the corner of Power Street and City Road to allow a safe distance between turning trucks and pedestrians.

Improve the public/private interface (potential to reduce driveway area).

Reinstate the kerb line near Southbank Boulevard to widen the footpath.
Remove left turn slip lanes at intersections with Southbank Boulevard and Southgate Avenue. Explore landscape improvements.

Upgrade medians (plant trees where possible).

'Y-Site' (Testing Grounds) to positively interface with City Road and when developed should provide direct access to the Arts Precinct.

Improve pedestrian wayfinding. Potential to become a more pedestrian focussed street.

Explore re-configuring, screening or enclosing this undercroft space to provide a more positive interface with the public realm.
Alexandra Avenue

Figure 6.4: Opportunities in Alexandra Avenue

Upgrade pedestrian walkway under St. Kilda Road. Explore potential for lighting/art.

Improve pedestrian access and way finding from City Road.

Improve DDA compliance.

Narrow traffic lanes to reduce crossing distance.

Provide a mid-block pedestrian crossing.
Figure 6.5 on the following pages illustrates the full suite of Key Move and Site Specific Opportunities.
Opportunities

City Connector

- Major upgrade
  - Establish City Road East as a spine within a cohesive Waterfront and Arts precinct

Kings Way Boyd Hub

- Major undercroft upgrade
  - Redefine City Road West as the spine of the local neighbourhood

Bicycle Access

- On road bicycle lane
- Rationalise turns at intersections

Pedestrian Access

- Pedestrian crossing
- Median / footpath upgrade
- Improve pedestrian connection
- Remove redundant crossovers
- Remove left turn slip lanes
- Private realm upgrades
- Public realm upgrades
APPENDIX A: TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT ANALYSIS
APPENDIX B: EXISTING SITE SECTIONS
Figure A.1 Location of Street Sections
Figure A.2 Existing Street Sections - City Road West
Figure A.3 Existing Street Sections - City Road East
Section H-H

Section K-K

Figure A.4 Existing Street Sections - Alexandra Avenue
How to contact us

**Online:** melbourne.vic.gov.au
Telephone: 03 9658 9658
7.30am to 6pm, Monday to Friday
(public holidays excluded)

**Translation services**
03 9280 0716 မြန်မာစိုက်
03 9280 0717 廣東話
03 9280 0718 Ελληνικά
03 9280 0719 Bahasa Indonesia
03 9280 0720 Italiano
03 9280 0721 鄭語
03 9280 0722 Soomaali
03 9280 0723 Español
03 9280 0724 Türkçe
03 9280 0725 Việt Ngữ
03 9280 0726 All other languages

**National Relay Service:** If you are deaf, hearing impaired or speech-impaired, call us via the National Relay Service: Teletypewriter (TTY) users phone 1300 555 727 then ask for 03 9658 9658
9am to 5pm, Monday to Friday
(public holidays excluded)

**In person:**
Melbourne Town Hall - Administration Building
120 Swanston Street, Melbourne
7.30am to 5pm, Monday to Friday
(public holidays excluded)

**In writing:**
City of Melbourne
GPO Box 1603
Melbourne VIC 3001
Australia

**Fax:** 03 9654 4854