



Benchmarking Report

Parking Management Policy Development

July 2019

Contents

Purpose of this document	3
Introduction of fixed parking precincts for individual permits, changed from street location based ..	4
Consolidation and simplification of the existing number of permit types	5
Resident parking at regional recreational destinations	8
Access to clubs that are in popular areas	8
Community organisations and agency permits	9
Introduction of single-use Visitor Parking Permits	9
Introduction of tiered pricing structure for permits and review of the maximum number of permits allowed per household, taking off-street parking into account.	10
Taking off-street parking into account	14
Investigation into a transition from paper to electronic permits for some uses to enable a better customer experience.....	14
Parking controls principles	14
Ticket Machine prices	15
Appendix 1: List of tables	16
Appendix 2. Benchmarking questions.....	16

Purpose of this document

The City of Port Phillip (CoPP) is developing a new Parking Management Policy to deliver on Action 30 and Action 31 of Council's Move, Connect, Live: Integrated Transport Strategy 2018-28 (Strategy).

The purpose of this benchmarking report is to examine current practice of parking policy across similar Victorian and interstate councils.

Councils were requested to respond to a range of questions (See Appendix 2 for a list of questions) about Parking Permits, controls and other parking related issues according to the following scope for the Parking Management Policy Development that was included in Council's Strategy:

1. Introduction of fixed parking precincts for individual permits, changed from street location based.
2. Consolidation and simplification of the existing number of permit types, including the introduction of single-use Visitor Parking Permits.
3. Review of the maximum number of permits allowed per household, taking off-street parking into account.
4. Introduction of tiered pricing structure for permits.
5. Investigation into a transition from paper to electronic permits for some uses to enable a better customer experience.
6. Parking controls principles.

The content of the report is structured underneath the above aspect of scope for the Parking Management Policy. The following councils provided information for this report.

Adjoining councils were surveyed to gain an understanding of neighbouring councils and to understand the consistency or lack thereof for residents and visitors to the area:

- Bayside
- Glen Eira
- Melbourne
- Stonnington

Similar councils in size and geographical context were also included in the benchmarking to understand the range of policies for managing parking in inner city Melbourne.

- Banyule – provided information on Resident Parking Permits only
- Boroondara - provided information on Resident Parking Permits only
- Darebin
- Maribyrnong - provided information on Resident Parking Permits only
- Moonee Valley
- Moreland
- Yarra

Similar interstate councils were benchmarked to gain perspective about parking around Australia. Councils were chosen that had similar geographical locations including highly desirable foreshore parking as well as high density populations.

- Sydney
- Waverley

Permit prices align to 2019/2020 budgets and information was correct at the time of analysis and cross marked with the Councils' public websites.

Introduction of fixed parking precincts for individual permits, changed from street location based

Local governments with high density areas such as City of Melbourne and City of Stonnington have Parking Permit areas (parking precincts) that are also used for local area traffic management studies to encourage the use of public transport. These areas are reviewed occasionally due to resident complaints or congestion around public transport and shops. The Parking Permit areas vary in size depending on location and local traffic contexts.

Other Councils like City of Yarra, City of Moonee Valley, Waverley City Council and City of Sydney have parking precincts known as parking scheme areas and Parking Permit zones.

Councils like the City of Glen Eira and Moreland City Council have street-by-street permit areas and the number of permits does not necessarily correlate to the number of on-street parking spaces. City of Glen Eira has areas of one-mile grid, with areas bigger in the south-east where there is less access to public transport and lower density.

City of Moreland is investigating whether moving towards precinct permits will address the issue of more permits than parking spaces in areas of high demand. This information is summarised in the table below.

Local Government Area	Fixed parking precincts?	How big are they?	How are the fixed parking precincts changed?
City of Port Phillip	No	Street location based.	Not applicable.

Adjoining Councils

Local Government Area	Fixed parking precincts?	How big are they?	How are the fixed parking precincts changed?
Bayside City Council	No	Street location based.	Not applicable.
City of Glen Eira	No	Street location based.	Not applicable.
City of Melbourne	Yes – Residential Parking Permit areas.	Mainly by suburb, some areas are smaller.	Resident complaints and occasionally pro-active reviews.
City of Stonnington	Yes – Permit areas.	Vary depending on location.	Resident letter or petition.

Similar Councils

Local Government Area	Fixed parking precincts?	How big are they?	How are the fixed parking precincts changed?
Darebin City Council	No	Street location based.	Policy currently under review.
City of Moonee Valley	Yes – Parking Permit areas.	Vary depending on location.	Resident complaints assess by a Parking Permit management committee.
Moreland City Council	No	Street location based.	Not applicable.
City of Yarra	Yes – Parking Permit zones.	Vary depending on location.	Established 1998 – do not change.

Similar Interstate Councils

Local Government Area	Fixed parking precincts?	How big are they?	How are the fixed parking precincts changed?
City of Sydney	Yes – Parking Permit areas.	Vary depending on location.	Resident petition.
Waverley City Council	Yes – Resident parking schemes.	Vary depending on location.	Resident complaints.

Table 1: Fixed parking precincts

Consolidation and simplification of the existing number of permit types

Local Government Area	Temporary	Tradesperson	Medical practitioners, community organisations etc.	Beach, event, other
City of Port Phillip	Cost dependent on location - minimum \$100 per permit.	\$55 weekly Tradesperson Parking Permit.	Free not-for-profit community service organisation making residential visits.	\$6 Party Parking Permit. \$61 per year resident Foreshore Parking Permit. \$122 Combined Resident and Foreshore Parking Permit. \$102 per year Foreshore Club Parking Permit.

Adjoining Councils

Local Government Area	Temporary	Tradesperson	Medical practitioners, community organisations etc.	Beach, event, other
Bayside City Council	Not applicable.	\$67.20 per week per vehicle.	Free temporary permits available for volunteers or special consideration.	Two free permits issued each year to each residence. \$231 Foreshore Club Permits are available to members of approved clubs and associations which operate at or along the foreshore within the municipality.
City of Glen Eira	Not applicable.	\$43 per week per vehicle up to a maximum of four per building site.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.
City of Melbourne	Not applicable.	\$52 per week.	\$270 annual permit for medical practitioners at inner city hospitals for on-street parking. Free permit for organisations transporting people with a disability.	\$120 for first event bay. \$60 for second event bay used for weddings, VIPs and filming. City Access Permit – for people with disabilities who attend work, study or specialist appointments in the City of Melbourne.
City of Stonnington	Not applicable.	\$30 per vehicle per month in residential areas. \$40 extension to one-month permit.	\$98 medical practitioner permit.	Not applicable.

Similar Councils

Local Government Area	Temporary	Tradesperson	Medical practitioners, community organisations etc.	Beach, event, other
Darebin City Council	\$42 four-week permit.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.
City of Moonee Valley	\$26 book of ten permits.	Not applicable.	Not applicable.	Major event day permits for businesses near Showgrounds and Flemington Racecourse.
Moreland City Council	Not applicable.	\$20 per week.	Not applicable.	Moreland User Pays Permit. \$100 first month within 12-month period. \$300 subsequent months within a 12-month period.
City of Yarra	Not applicable.	Free – maximum of three permits.	\$134 first medical practitioner permit. \$248 second medical practitioner permit. Free – two permits for non-profit organisation volunteers.	Not applicable.

Similar Interstate Councils

Local Government Area	Temporary	Tradesperson	Medical practitioners, community organisations etc.	Beach, event, other
City of Sydney	Not applicable.	\$53 per week.	\$54 per year support work Parking Permit. \$54 per year carers Parking Permit.	Not applicable.
Waverley City Council	Not applicable.	\$90 per week.	\$50 per year carers permit.	\$1,700 annual non-resident beach carpark permit. \$145 annual resident beach carpark permit. Teachers beach Parking Permit. Active patrolling surf club member.

Table 2: Permit types

Resident parking at regional recreational destinations

City of Port Phillip currently provides Foreshore and Combined Parking Permits to allow residents to park in designated locations along the foreshore. A number of Councils benchmarked had Resident Parking Permits for highly desirable local destinations including Bayside City Council which issues two free beach Parking Permits, allowing residents to park free in foreshore carparks within Bayside including Beach Road and the Esplanade.

Waverley City Council charges \$1,700 for non-residents and \$145 for residents and ratepayers annually for parking in two beach carparks. The permits are for one car only.

Access to clubs that are in popular areas

Most councils do not provide these permits which may relate to the small number of high demand club areas such as foreshores in their areas.

City of Port Phillip provides foreshore clubs with a \$102 annual Parking Permit, while Bayside Council charges \$231 per annual permit for foreshore clubs. Waverly Council has permits for active patrolling surf club members only.

Community organisations and agency permits

The majority of Councils benchmarked did not provide organisation permits but those that did provided a range of permits for community-based and not-for-profit organisations to assist staff and volunteers to park near their workplaces.

The City of Yarra provides permits at no charge for volunteers at non-profit organisations and are limited to two per organisation. City of Melbourne provides one permit to organisations transporting people with a significant ambulatory or intellectual disability, while the City of Sydney provides a permit to social support worker who provide in-home care to clients.

Introduction of single-use Visitor Parking Permits

Single-use Visitor Parking Permits were available from two adjoining councils and varied in the total amount available for each household per year and the price of the vouchers.

Adjoining Council

Local Government Area	Single-use Visitor Parking Permits?	Number of vouchers available per year	Cost
City of Melbourne	Yes - Visitor voucher booklet of 18 single-use vouchers can be purchased every two months. A booklet contains 12 3-hour, four 24-hour and two weekend vouchers with no expiry.	108	\$40 for booklet of 18. (\$2.22 per voucher.)
City of Stonnington	Yes - Residents can purchase up to fifteen Visitor Parking Permits that are valid for 24 hours.	15	\$5 per voucher.

Similar Councils

Local Government Area	Single-use Visitor Parking Permits?	Number of vouchers available per year	Cost
Moreland City Council	Yes - Books of 10 scratch tickets valid for that day only (no expiry).	10	\$24.20 for book of 10. (\$2.42 per voucher.)

Similar Interstate Councils

Local Government Area	Single-use Visitor Parking Permits?	Number of vouchers available per year	Cost
City of Sydney	Yes.	<p>Zone A: 10 for household with two Resident Parking Permits. 30 for household with one Resident Parking Permit. 40 for household with zero Resident Parking Permits.</p> <p>Zone B: 20 for household with two Resident Parking Permits. 40 for household with one Resident Parking Permit. 60 for household with zero Resident Parking Permits.</p>	\$2 per voucher.
Waverley City Council	Yes – Daily Visitor Parking Permit (pack of 10 per residence).	10	\$23 for pack of 10. (\$2.30 per voucher.)

Table 3: Single-use Visitor Parking Permits

Introduction of tiered pricing structure for permits and review of the maximum number of permits allowed per household, taking off-street parking into account.

Benchmarked Councils provided a range of different structures for household permit scenarios including the number of permits allowed, maximum number of Visitor Parking Permits and the cost and type of the permits.

The cost of Resident Parking Permits including Visitor Parking Permits varied greatly from all permits being free to prices of up to \$505 for a second Visitor Parking Permit. Three out of four of the adjacent Councils have at least the first Resident Parking Permit free with tiered pricing thereafter.

Further information including cost of permits is outlined below.

Local Government Area	Annual Visitor Parking Permit?	Number of permits per household (Visitor and resident)	Cost
City of Port Phillip	Yes.	Three – maximum two Visitor Parking Permits.	\$83 – Resident Parking Permit. \$112 – Visitor Parking Permit. \$122 – Combined Parking Permit.

Adjoining Councils

Local Government Area	Annual Visitor Parking Permit?	Number of permits per household (Visitor and resident)	Cost
Bayside City Council	No – three-year permit.	Five – maximum one Visitor Parking Permit.	Free – four Resident Parking Permits. \$196 - fifth Resident Parking Permit. \$76 – Visitor Parking Permit.
City of Glen Eira	Yes – transferable between resident and visitor.	Four.	Free – first three permits. \$116 – fourth permit.
City of Melbourne	Yes – transferable between resident and visitor.	Varies from zero to two depending on location.	\$40 – first permit. \$130 – second permit.
City of Stonnington	Not applicable.	Varies from three to five permits depending on characteristics of the street.	Free – first two permits. \$98 - third permit. \$109 – fourth permit. \$140 – fifth permit.

Similar Councils

Local Government Area	Annual Visitor Parking Permit?	Number of permits per household (Visitor and resident)	Cost
Banyule City Council	Yes.	Varies from zero to four depending on type of dwelling and when constructed.	Free – first Resident Parking Permit. \$30 – second Resident Parking Permit. \$45 – first Visitor Parking Permit. \$65 – second Visitor Parking Permit.
Boroondara City Council	Yes.	Varies between one and three depending on type of dwelling and when constructed.	Free.
Darebin City Council	Yes.	Two but if residents have access to off-street parking then entitled to one less permit.	\$42 – first permit. \$64 – second permit.
Maribyrnong City Council	Yes.	Varies from zero to four depending on parking zone.	Free – first Resident Parking Permit. \$60 – second Resident Parking Permit. \$50 – first Visitor Parking Permit. \$70 – second Visitor Parking Permit.
City of Moonee Valley	Yes.	Varies from zero to four but if residents have access to off-street parking then entitled to one less permit.	Free – first Resident Parking Permit. \$60 - second Resident Parking Permit (starts 1 November 2019). Free – first Visitor Parking Permit. \$77.50 – second Visitor Parking Permit.

Local Government Area	Annual Visitor Parking Permit?	Number of permits per household (Visitor and resident)	Cost
Moreland City Council	Yes.	Varies from one to two but if residents have access to off-street parking then entitled to one less permit.	\$41.20 – first Resident Parking Permit. \$116.50 – second Resident Parking Permit.
City of Yarra	Yes – one transferable Visitor Parking Permit.	Varies from one to three, grandfathering of three permits underway.	\$40 – first permit. \$98 – second permits. \$184 – third permit.

Similar Interstate Councils

Local Government Area	Annual Visitor Parking Permit?	Number of permits per household (Visitor and resident)	Cost
City of Sydney	No.	Varies depending on location and grandfathering.	\$81 - first Resident Parking Permit. \$124 – second Resident Parking Permit.
Waverley City Council	Yes.	Varies between zero and three depending on number of off-street carparks.	Free – First Resident Parking Permit. \$145 – second Resident Parking Permit. \$220 – third Resident Parking Permit. \$175 – first Visitor Parking Permit. \$505 – second and third Visitor Parking Permit.

Table 4: Household permits

Taking off-street parking into account

The cities of Darebin, Moonee Valley, Moreland and Waverley all take off-street carparking into account for total Resident Parking Permit allowance.

The type of area considered as off-street parking varied between Councils. The City of Darebin Resident Parking Permit Policy, 2017 defines it as “an area designed for parking a vehicle, that is a driveway, garage etc.” while Moonee Valley City Council Parking Permit Policy, 2013 defines the area as “a crossover”. The Moreland City Council Parking Management Policy, 2019 takes off-street carparking to mean a “vehicle crossover”.

One off-street carparking area results in a loss of one Resident Parking Permit in each Council.

Determining whether properties have off-street parking was mainly checked online followed by a site visit if not clear.

Investigation into a transition from paper to electronic permits for some uses to enable a better customer experience.

A number of councils are looking at trialling electronic permits progressively for all types of permits.

To overcome residents’ objections to not being able to check permits on dashboards, options around online check options are being investigated in a similar way to that of VicRoads online vehicle registration system.

Parking controls principles

Benchmarking has shown that the review of parking controls for the majority of councils is initiated by petition from residents or businesses. The relevant area of Council then undertakes parking assessments or studies and make recommendations for changing parking controls.

Ticket Machine prices

No data available based on information sourced from benchmarked Councils which indicates that dynamic and demand-based pricing has not been implemented.

Local Government Area	Minimum hourly fee	Maximum hourly fee	Daily fee	Dynamic (demand-based)?
City of Port Phillip	\$1	\$5.50	\$6.90 to \$13.20	Some seasonal changes.
City of Glen Eira	\$2.20 for the first two hours.	Not applicable.	\$5.90	No charge for public holidays or weekends.
City of Melbourne	\$1	\$7	\$8 to \$52	Information not available.
City of Sydney	\$3.20	\$7.40	Not applicable.	On and off-peak pricing.
Waverley City Council	\$3.90	\$8	\$19.50	Seasonal pricing.

Table 5: Ticket Machine prices

Appendix 1: List of tables

Table 1. Fixed parking precincts

Table 2. Permit types

Table 3. Single-use Visitor Parking Permits

Table 4. Household permits

Table 5. Ticket Machine prices

Appendix 2. Benchmarking questions

A summary of questions asked of councils are outlined below:

What type of permits do you have and what are the eligibility criteria?

How many permits are permitted?

What is the cost of permits?

How are permits applied for?

What are the parking rules attached to permits? Do these work? Are there issues?

How do they manage resident access to destination activity parking (e.g. for us, foreshore)?

How do they manage access to clubs etc, that are in popular areas?

Do they have community organisation and agency permits?

Are Parking Zones used and how?

How is Car Share parking managed?

How are new charges and decreasing number of permits set?

How are on-street parking ticketed prices set? What are they based on?

How often, or when was their last pricing review (other than annual increment)? Or is it dynamic?

Does anyone use e-permits?

Recommendations