North East Link Project
Manningham Club & Hotel, 1 – 11 Thompsons Road, Bulleen
Expert Evidence – Traffic & Transport (Supplement)

190406REP002A-F
5 September 2019
## Document Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepared for</th>
<th>ALH Group Property Holdings Pty Ltd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>File Name</td>
<td>190406REP002A-F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report Date</td>
<td>5 September 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepared by</td>
<td>Valentine Gnanakone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviewed by</td>
<td>James Dear</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© One Mile Grid Pty Ltd. This document has been prepared by onemilegrid for the sole use and benefit of the client as per the terms of engagement. It may not be modified or altered, copied, reproduced, sold or transferred in whole or in part in any format to any person other than by agreement. onemilegrid does not assume responsibility or liability to any third party arising out of use or misuse of this document.
CONTENTS

1  INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................................................. 4

2  CONCLAVES ....................................................................................................................................................... 5

  2.1  Overview ......................................................................................................................................................... 5

  2.2  24 July 2019 ..................................................................................................................................................... 5

  2.3  5 August 2019 .................................................................................................................................................. 5

  2.4  7 August 2019 .................................................................................................................................................. 5

3  BULLEEN SWITCH DESIGN ................................................................................................................................... 6

  3.1  Proposed Works .............................................................................................................................................. 6

  3.2  Review ............................................................................................................................................................ 6

  3.2.1  Access Road .................................................................................................................................................. 6

  3.2.2  Bulleen Road Signals ..................................................................................................................................... 7

4  BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE RELOCATION - OPTION 3 .................................................................................. 8

5  CONSTRUCTION .................................................................................................................................................... 8

6  CONCLUSION ......................................................................................................................................................... 8

FIGURES

Figure 1  Impact of Acquisition Line .......................................................................................................................... 7
1 INTRODUCTION

My name is Valentine Gnanakone and I am Director at onemilegrid where I practice as a traffic engineer.

I previously prepared an expert evidence statement dated 16 July 2019 to assess the traffic and access implications as a result of the North East Link Project (the Project) on the Manningham Club & Hotel (the Club).

Since that time, I have been provided with additional information from the NELA and have also attended numerous traffic engineering conclaves as described below:

- Conclaves
  - 24 July 2019 at GTA Consultants
  - 5 August 2019 at O’Brien Traffic
  - 7 August 2019 at GTA Consultants

- Additional Information provided by the NELA
  - Bulleen Alternative Design Option – ‘Bulleen Switch’
  - NELP Manningham Club Area Affected by SCO(PSA)
  - Boroondara Tennis Centre Relocation Reference Design Option 3
  - Construction Staging 2a – Bulleen Road Diversion V4

The provision of the additional information and attendance at the conclaves has largely unaffected my original opinions, with numerous ‘gaps’ in information still prevalent.

My further opinions in relation to the additional information provided by the NELA follow.
2 CONCLAVES

2.1 Overview

I attended a total of three conclaves as part of this proceeding, which I understand minutes for each has been circulated to the IAC.

2.2 24 July 2019

The first conclave was convened by Mr. Kiriakidis and related to the concerns raised within my evidence. It was attended by myself and NELP witnesses only.

Further information to satisfy my concerns in relation to the operation of the Thompsons Road and Bulleen Road access points was not provided, however Mt. Kiriakidis and I did agree that further analysis should be undertaken. Particularly at the interface with Thompsons Road and Bulleen Road.

It is my strong view that this analysis should be undertaken now as it will have a significant impact on the composition of the access intersections to Bulleen Road and Thompsons Road with regard to the number of lanes required at the intersection and associated capacity improvements.

The current plans in my view do not provide sufficient capacity to cater for the level of traffic generated. I acknowledge that I have not undertaken any SIDRA analysis to verify this however it is clear to me based on my experience of intersection operation that a single lane in and out of these access points will not be sufficient.

I note that within the minutes at Item 2.3 that access from the Park and Ride Facility to Bulleen Road was minuted as discussed. I did not agree with this proposition and furthermore highlight that this was not discussed in any way aside from a passing comment by others. At this stage there was no information pertaining to a connection for the Park and Ride Facility to Bulleen Road.

In relation to construction, I am generally satisfied that, provided access is retained at all times to the Club, the impacts are manageable through the Environmental Performance Requirements (EPR).

2.3 5 August 2019

A second conclave was held at O’Brien Traffic attended by non-NELP traffic witnesses.

Aside from an agreement that more information was required to adequately assess our areas of concern, which at this stage had not been provided, no material agreements were made concerning the Manningham Club.

I confirm my view that rather than separate individual meetings / conclaves on 24 July 2019 that a group conclave would have been more appropriate.

2.4 7 August 2019

The third conclave was convened by Mr. Kiriakidis with all relevant traffic experts present. The intention of the conclave was to provide additional information pertaining to the ‘Bulleen Switch’ design.

More information was provided with regard to the Bulleen Switch design however no additional analysis was provided by the NELP experts. As noted in my original conclave (24 July), I do not believe the existing allowances for the access intersection scope is sufficient and additional analysis should be undertaken now, rather than delaying to another time.
3  BULLEEN SWITCH DESIGN

3.1 Proposed Works

The Bulleen Switch design provided by the NELA proposes a modified arrangement at Bulleen Road, with the Thompsons Road access arrangements generally consistent with the previous design.

A summary of the works follows with the ‘new’ works in **bold**.

- Construction of a new park and ride facility;
- Construction of a new public road in the southeast corner of the site for the park and ride facility linking to Thompsons Road;
- **Construction of a new public road from the north of the park and ride facility, linking to a new set of signals to Bulleen Road (via the Manningham Club and Marcellin College);**
- Modifications to the existing Thompsons Road Club access;
- Construction of a busway with priority signalised intersection;
- Closure of the Club’s Bulleen Road access;
- **Construction of an access road from the Manningham Club linking to the new public road for the park and ride facility to Bulleen Road;**
- Acquisition of land to provide a connection to the Manningham Club;
- Construction of an access road from Marcellin College linking to the new public road for the park and ride facility to Bulleen Road;
- **Construction of a new set of traffic signals to Bulleen Road forming a cross intersection with Marcellin College / Manningham Club / Park & Ride Facility on the east side and a new Carey Grammar Sports Ground Access on the west side;**
- Realignment of Bulleen Road;
- Elevation of tunnel on and off ramps above Bulleen Road;
- Details of the BusWay and associated bus stops;
- Ramps to and from the tunnel portals linking to the Eastern Freeway.

3.2 Review

I have undertaken a review of the Bulleen Switch design and provide the following opinions.

3.2.1 Access Road

A common access road is now proposed to link Marcellin College, the Club and the Park and Ride Facility. The common access road connects to Bulleen Road via a new set of signals which forms a cross intersection with the Carey Sports Grounds access road to the west.

Under existing conditions, the Club enjoys direct access to Bulleen Road. As part of this proposal, the Club’s access will be relocated almost 200 metres further north, away from the main Club buildings thus impacting on the Club’s exposure to Bulleen Road and ‘sense of address’.

The acquisition line on the Bulleen Switch plan shows an acquisition of land which would accommodate the new access road which currently accommodates in the order of 68 car spaces. Depending on the final outcome with the access road, it appears that a reorientation of the Club’s car park will be required for circulation which could result in the loss of a further 4 spaces as shown in Figure 1.
3.2.2 Bulleen Road Signals

As part of the Bulleen Switch, a new set of signals is proposed which will form a cross intersection (4-way) with the common access road which accommodates Marcellin College, the Club and the Park and Ride Facility with the Carey Sports Grounds access road to the west.

The signals are currently shown as a single approach and departure lane on the east approach. I have significant concerns with regard to the ability for this configuration to cater for the level of traffic generated, noting the following:

- The extent of components using the access road such as Marcellin, the park and ride facility and the Club all of which will have a peak period putting pressure on the signals;
- The shared through and right turn lane configuration will necessitate ‘split phases’ which will result in an inefficient signal operation;
- Limited turning capacity afforded; and
- The likely signal phasing which will provide limited ‘green time’ to the side roads.

It was agreed at the conclave on 7 August that further analysis would be required in this location.

I am strongly of the view that the analysis should be undertaken now, as it is my opinion that there are significant capacity issues in the current form. Improvements to the intersection are possible, however these improvements will require a larger intersection which has not been allowed for.
Boroondara Tennis Centre Relocation - Option 3

I have been provided with a further plan which depicts the relocated tennis centre, referred to as Option 3. I note that this plan does not align with a number of facets of the Bulleen Switch plan. These include:

- Option 3 Tennis Club plan removes / does not show an access road into the park and ride facility from Bulleen Road.
- The Marcellin College Access track links in a different location.

In addition to the above, no analysis has been provided to determine if this additional use will be able to be catered for by the signals to the north at Bulleen Road.

Further, there is potential for overflow into the Club’s car park which may impact availability for patrons.

Construction

I have reviewed the Bulleen Road diversion plan which indicates a reorientation of Bulleen Road during construction. This plan retains access to the Club which I support.

Conclusion

Having had an opportunity to review the additional information, I am still of the view that further consideration is required with regard to the operation of the Club access and any shared access arrangements that are proposed.

Of note, I am not satisfied that the operation of Bulleen Road access has been suitably analysed.