



**Application Number 1003316**

## **Comments to Yumbah responses**

I am making comment on the responses Yumbah has made to the issues raised in submissions and questions asked at the community consultation as I have serious concerns about the project and what Yumbah has said. I feel that the overall response from Yumbah is vague, non specific and does not address the issues raised to a satisfactory level. In parts it is dismissive and the use of the word “irrelevant” in several points of response shows at best a lack of understanding of the issues raised, at worst arrogance.

First and foremost I wish to state that it is overwhelmingly obvious that Dutton Way is the wrong location on so many levels and this application must be rejected. There is nothing in the response to reassure the residents and public about the impacts to their homes, lifestyle and the land and ocean environments. For the people who live on Dutton Way, for locals and visitors who love and enjoy this unique place, that this project will have a devastating impact on their lifestyle and wellbeing. I am not opposed to the large scale abalone industry, what I am opposed to is the location. I find it extremely frustrating, when there are more suitable, appropriate and remote locations available for Yumbah to consider for this operation.

**Air quality odour-** I do not believe that there will be no odour associated with this enterprise. I walk my dogs next to where the Narrawong abalone farm is and on certain days there is a strong and distinctive odour, as argued this odour is not just seasonal ocean smell, as a life long beach walker I know that smell. To say that odours will stop at the boundary, as stated in their response is ridiculous, odours go where the wind takes them they know no boundaries, they will travel as far as the odour molecules will last. The plan shows that sediment ponds will be very close to residents; there will be without a doubt odour detected at these residences

**Marine waters** – Despite all the science stated in their response, and their statement that , “ The operation of the farm will not have any ongoing detrimental impact” There has never been an operation like this ever to compare what will happen to the ocean environment when this is fully operational. There will, without a doubt, be detrimental effects, how much is unknown and for that this operation is too big a risk. Once the damage is done unless they cease to operate in this area it could be devastating, no guarantees here.

**Noise and vibration** - There will be noise and there will be vibration, how much? Well who knows? The size of the pumps proposed are huge and even placed under the ground there will be noise and vibration. The volume of water moving in the pipes will create noise. Regardless of noise guidelines and compliances, the residents of Dutton Way chose to live in a peaceful, tranquil location that has no industrial noise or vibration (those pumps are industrial), so any noise and vibration is taking the peace and tranquillity from them, this must be considered. They say the suitability of the separation distances will maintain the amenity, well I do not.

**Site conditions** - I have serious concerns about the construction phase and long term impact in relation to the water table. Along Dutton Way you only have to dig 1.5 m to hit the watertable, it is a very sensitive area. Yumbah talks about dewatering during the construction phase, is this enough in a unique area like Dutton Way? They have not addressed this issue thoroughly enough, are they equipped to handle the level of water that will rise? Have they considered the immediate and long term effects of this on the location and the residents? Who is responsible in the case of immediate and long term major impact of the consequences of construction on the environment and the residents? Will it be Yumbah, Glenelg Shire, the State Government?

**Tourism** - In regards to the response on tourism, that Dutton Way is not on the Glenelg Shires Planning Scheme as an identified tourist destination, so what. Dutton Way has 3 caravan/camping parks and has at least 36 Holiday House rentals; I think real evidence speaks for itself. This is very much a tourist destination. This proposed operation will impact on the amenity and experience for tourists and numbers of tourists if it goes ahead.

**Pipelines to and from the Ocean** – There is to be exclusion zones on the intake pipes, it has not been specified how they will apply the exclusion and how much space these zones take. Are they above water on the beach as well as under the water? What impact will that have on recreational users of the beach and underwater? This has not been addressed.

These pipes are on the beach coming from the Narrawong abalone farm, they are large and ugly, weighted down with large chains attached to large cubes of concrete. They will most definitely destroy the amenity of the Dutton Way for beach goers as the size of them will make it impossible for people to walk without impediment. Dutton Way is one of a very few places that you can take your dog lead free for a run along the beach. It will spoil the look and the recreational and healing benefits so many of us go to this beach for. I don't believe Yumbah has the right to take that from the people when there are other locations with less human interaction.

**Future development of the location** Yumbah talks about this operation as only being the production of abalone. However according to an article that appeared in The Australian newspaper, January 21, Tim Rudge talks about a cannery and processing plant to be built in Portland. There has been discussion of a stage 2 of Yumbah Nyambat at the Dutton Way

location, I fear that in the future once this first stage is up and running, that they will construct cannery and processing plant on this site. Zoning laws are easily changed when it suits and we see this often. Once it starts it won't stop.

**Responsibility for environmental impact and restitution** - Despite all that is said in the responses this planned operation has never been done on this scale before, therefore nobody knows what the impact on the residents, the land and ocean environments is going to be. I am deeply concerned that if there are major issues arising who will deal with them, who will take responsibility, what guarantees do the residents and the environment have that they will be dealt with appropriately in a timely manner.

**Industry in the Glenelg Shire** – Industry has never been planned very well in the past and present in the Glenelg Shire. There is industry scattered all over the place, along town boundaries and chunks of land in the town as well. There are too many houses with industry literally butted up to the back fences. There are industrial zones in the middle of town fully surrounded by residential areas. Portland North School is surrounded by industry and it's growing. Narrow rural residential roads are being used to transport oversized trucks and their convoys carrying wind blades, due to a lack of foresight in town planning. Please do not make the Yumbah industrial proposal another planning disaster with industry lurking over the fences of residents, people having to suffer with the impositions of industry in their residential neighbourhoods.

**Conclusion – Wrong location! Wrong location! Wrong location!** - The response from Yumbah does not at all convince me that this would not impact heavily on the residents, recreational users and tourists on Dutton Way. This industrial proposal will most definitely take and change the uniqueness, peace, tranquillity, beauty and lifestyle that is and should remain what Dutton Way is as we know it. I feel there are far too many risks of loss and destruction for the residents and the public users of Dutton Way if this application is approved. In the spirit of common sense there are other options available for Yumbah to build this operation. The time has come for them to drop the idea of Dutton Way and begin the process of acquiring a suitable site as this area is most definitely not the right location.