North East Link Project
Presentation to the IAC Hearing
21 August 2019

Impacts on Active Open Space

Richard Simon
Initial Observations

- Support the collaborative approach between NELP, the councils, and the sporting clubs/groups to minimise impacts of the Project on sporting facilities
- Some good outcomes already achieved, some are still evolving, and some are difficult to achieve
- Commitment by all stakeholders (including NELP) to want to reduce the disruption to sporting organisations as far as practicable, and in accordance with EPR SC1, SCNEW1, SCNEW2 & SC4
My Task

- To assess the adequacy of the exhibited North East Link EES in the area of active open space in the Cities of Banyule, Boroondara and Whitehorse

- Specifically, to assess the degree to which the options impacting active open space "accommodate displaced facilities and user groups, and maintain the continuity of those activities" [Ref: EES Technical Report I Social, p169]
My Task

Additional information has been provided and considered since my expert witness statement was completed:

1. NELP Technical Note 37: Sport and Recreation Relocation Update (Doc #105)
2. NELP Technical Note R34: Potential Bulleen Road Modification (Doc #102)
   Plan labelled ‘Reference Project with Bulleen Road Diversion
3. NELP Technical Note 43: Southern Portal Permanent Flood Wall Location (Doc #148), includes plan showing Alternate Design Option for Bulleen Road Diversion
4. NELP Plan Boroondara Tennis Centre Relocation Reference Design Option 3 (Doc #196a)
5. NELP Investigations Related to Tennis Centre Relocation – Musca Street Reserve (Doc #207c)
6. EPRs Revision 1 (Doc #130)
7. EPR SC2 Revision (Doc #185)
8. NEL Sporting Club Relocation Report (Banyule Council Meeting, 5 Aug 2019)
Sites assessed
Key Strategic Considerations

Current and projected population of each LGA

- strong population growth is projected for each LGA

Strategic assessment of sporting needs for each LGA

- each LGA is projecting increased demand for sporting facilities, but have only limited existing capacity to absorb additional sporting needs
Key Site-Specific Considerations

1. Sport type
2. Relationship of re-location option to the existing catchment of the club/group
3. Scope and condition (compliance) of facilities that are available, or will be available, at the re-location option
4. Level of acceptance or otherwise by the club/group and council of the re-location option
5. Club/group sustainability likelihood at the re-location option (displacement could be for up to 7 years)
# ACTIVE OPEN SPACE Banyule

3 reserves ..... 7 user groups ..... more than 1,450 direct participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reserve</th>
<th>Club</th>
<th>Relocation Option (per EES)</th>
<th>Alternate Relocation Option (per Council / clubs)</th>
<th>Appropriate / Adequate (per R Simon)</th>
<th>NELP Approved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AK Lines Reserve</td>
<td>St Marys Greensborough Junior Football Club</td>
<td>Greensborough College</td>
<td>Whatmough Park &amp; Greensborough Park</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>not currently being considered by NELP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plenty Valley Cricket Club</td>
<td>Binnak Park</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Watsonia Sporting Club (football)</td>
<td>Barling Reserve (City of Dandenong) or Redleaf Reserve (City of Whittlesea)</td>
<td>Binnak Park</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabonia Avenue Reserve</td>
<td>Watsonia Heights Football Club (soccer)</td>
<td>Greensborough College</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winsor Reserve</td>
<td>Macleod Cricket Club</td>
<td>Greensborough College</td>
<td>Macleod College</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>under discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Macleod Junior Football Club</td>
<td>Greensborough College</td>
<td>Macleod College</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>under discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>De Winton Park</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACTIVE OPEN SPACE Boroondara

Boroondara Tennis Centre (est. 100,000 patrons per year)
- 23 courts
- Clubhouse/ administration
- Car parking (85 vehicles)
- Other infrastructure (shelters, stores, paths)

Freeway Public Golf Course (est. 55,000 rounds per year)
- 18-hole course
- 5,078m in length
- Par 69
BOROONDAARA TENNIS CENTRE

Key considerations

- Has State and National significance as a tennis venue
- Current patronage in excess of 100,000 per annum
- Is owned by Boroondara Council
- Supports numerous tennis activities and services, and players of all abilities
- Critical that there is no disruption to business during Project construction and operation

Relocation options assessed on the following pages:

1. Boroondara Tennis Centre Relocation Reference Design Option 3 (Doc #196a)
2. Boroondara Tennis Centre Relocation - Musca Street Reserve (Doc #207c)
3. Option 7 - Appendix 2 (EES Technical Report I Social, Appendix F SROA)
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Option 3 Constraints

• Land size
• Land is subject to inundation: 1:100 ARI is 18.22 metres
• Grade changes between courts
• Hydrology impacts from covering Koonung Creek are still unknown
• Limited overflow car parking (events)
• Lack of provision for bus access
• Amenity is impacted by the adjacent NEL ramps
• All courts (23) will not be available during Project construction ...... complex becomes unfeasible as a competition venue
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Option 3 Constraints (cont)

- NELP’s own plan states in ‘Notes’:
  - “There are impacts associated with this option as a result of covering Koonung Creek that would require further assessment ……”
  - “…… constrained site …… limited available space for future expansion”
  - “…… would require a staged approach with a reduced number of courts being available during construction ……”
  - “…… site would be directly adjacent to major construction activities ……”

- Replacement facility will be a ‘1980s version’ of a regional tennis facility
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Option 3 vs a Contemporary Regional Tennis Complex

Hume Tennis & Community Centre
Boroondara Tennis Centre

Option 3 Constraints (cont)

- Proposed Bulleen Road temporary diversion passes through the site of the Option 3 proposal
  (assumes Alternate Design for Bulleen Road temporary diversion to the west, is not adopted)

- There is a possible requirement to provide a north access for the Bulleen Park & Ride
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Musca Street Reserve Option

ACTIVE OPEN SPACE Richard Simon
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Musca Street Reserve Option

- Land size: approx. 31,000sqm (BTC approx. 27,000sqm)
- Topography and landscape: challenging; treed setting
- Zoning is PPRZ, but there exist two significant overlays:
  - Land Subject to Inundation
  - Significant Landscape
- Access: currently possible from Musca Street only
- Amenity: most adjoining properties sit proud of the reserve
- Other comments: cost prohibitive, reserve is part of Yarra River corridor

My overall assessment is that the site is inappropriate and unable to accommodate a relocated Boroondara Tennis Centre
Issues/Constraints (physical):
- Courts are in a floodplain
- Significant earthwork/batteries required for eastern courts and southwest courts
- Amenity impacts on nearby dwellings

Issues/Constraints (functional):
- Little opportunity to expand the facility
- Clubhouse has no relationship to car park and main patron access
- No show-court and little potential for tournament overlay
- No obvious overflow car parking options
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE

Freeway Public Golf Course Option 7

(Ref: Appendix 2, EES Technical Report I Social, Appendix F SROA)
BOROONDARA TENNIS CENTRE RELOCATION
CONCEPT SITE PLAN
1:2000 @ A3 APPROX.
FREEWAY GOLF CLUB SITE

FUTURE EXPANSION CAPACITY
GROWN DASHED

URBAN FOREST SQUARE

APPROXIMATE LOCATION OF ROADWAY
LIKE TO SPEER PAV.

ITF PRO COURTS

COMMUNITY LOCATED BOROOONDARA
TENNIS CENTER FACILITY WITH
VIEWING OVER ALL COURTS.
(800m² FOOTPRINT ILLUSTRATED
APPROXIMATELY)

23 XITE SIZED ACRYLIC HARDWOODS
ILLUSTRATED. (NOTE: 2 COURSES SHOWN
WITH TWO BALL NOT SHOT) - TEC

COMMUNITY HUB

PRELIMINARY - FOR DISCUSSION ONLY
FREEWAY PUBLIC GOLF COURSE

Key considerations

- Is a public 18-hole golf course (5,078 metres, Par 69)
- Is one of the most successful and popular public courses in Melbourne’s north east (approx. 55,000 rounds per annum)
- Supports two golf clubs (80% of their members reside in Manningham and Boroondara), and 82% of all other patrons reside in Manningham, Boroondara and Whitehorse

It is my opinion that the golf course:
1. remain an 18-hole course
2. be not less than a distance of 5,000m
3. be at least a Par 68 course.
FREEWAY PUBLIC GOLF COURSE

• If the replacement Boroondara Tennis Centre is located on a site within the golf course, then the retention of an 18-hole golf course requires additional land.

• The land to be acquired by NELP in the Bulleen Park precinct for the Project, including for the Bulleen Park & Ride, results in there being insufficient land left to accommodate all of the existing facilities within the Bulleen Park precinct.

• The proposed tennis facility layout prepared by Sportdev is an appropriate layout for a replacement facility for the Boroondara Tennis Centre, and is consistent with NELP Option 7.
FREEWAY PUBLIC GOLF COURSE

Golf course concept plans

- 18 holes
- 5,101 metres, Par 68
- Integrated with the replacement tennis centre
- Additional tree plantings
- New access to the golf course from the north

The need for the retention of an 18-hole course is outlined in my report, which draws on research and data from golf experts

(Ref: EES Technical Report I Social, Appendix F SROA Option 7)
# Active Open Space Whitehorse

1 reserve ..... 2 user groups ..... more than 750 direct participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reserve</th>
<th>Club</th>
<th>Relocation Option (per EES)</th>
<th>Alternate Relocation Option (per Council/ clubs)</th>
<th>Appropriate/Adequate (per R Simon)</th>
<th>NELP Approved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Increase the water storage capacity</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elgar Park NW Oval</td>
<td>Mont Albert Cricket Club (senior teams)</td>
<td>Wilsons Reserve (Doncaster)</td>
<td>Kingswood College (potential)</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>Initial assessment by NELP, but not included in Tech Note 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(City of Manningham)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Springfield Park West Oval (Box Hill North)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>✅</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Construction laydown site</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elgar Park NE Oval</td>
<td>Mont Albert Cricket Club (junior teams)</td>
<td>Bennettswood Reserve North Oval</td>
<td>Mont Albert Reserve (potential)</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>✅</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>KBH Brumbies Hockey Club</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ELGAR PARK HOCKEY FIELD

Other key considerations

- A synthetic hockey pitch is immediately west of the NE Oval
- Supports more than 650 hockey players of all ages (KBH Brumbies), school teams, and Hockey Victoria pathway teams
- Usage of the pitch is at capacity in winter (7 days), and there is high usage in summer (5 days)
- The facility manager (Elgar Park Regional Hockey Association) has financial obligations linked directly to the ongoing SUCCESSFUL operation of the pitch:
  - Repayment of a loan with the Whitehorse City Council for funds to upgrade the pitch, the floodlights, and associated other infrastructure (2014)
  - Annual contributions into a sinking fund to finance the resurfacing of the pitch in 2024
ELGAR PARK HOCKEY FIELD

Hockey Pitch

North East Oval

Excluded
Temporary occupation

ACTIVE OPEN SPACE Richard Simon 25
ELGAR PARK HOCKEY FIELD

Issues impacting the successful operation of the pitch, and the continued sustainability of the KBH Brumbies for up to 7 years:

- Change in the noise and air environment for players and spectators
- Dust on the surface of the pitch will reduce the performance of the pitch, reduce its playability and functional life – will require increased volunteer hours to clean and maintain the surface
- Noise, dust and trucks = reduced levels of enjoyment/ perceptions of safety of players, parents and spectators, and hirers (schools)

Reduced usage will lead to:

1. less $$, which will reduce the capacity for the EPRHA to services its loan obligations and contribute to a sinking fund
2. less players joining the Brumbies (via HookIn2hockey), which will impact its player pathway and future numbers in junior and senior teams.
The proposed use of the North East Oval as a lay down venue is not preferred due to the impact on hockey and the junior cricket teams, and the Eram Park alternate option in my opinion should be fully investigated.

However, if it is determined that the NE Oval will be used as a Project construction lay down site, it will be important that the EPRs are appropriate to ameliorate the impact on the hockey facilities and activities:

1. Hours of use
2. Access to facilities and car parks
3. Dust and noise minimisation
4. Pitch maintenance requirements
5. Reinstatement of the NE Oval to the satisfaction of Council